

Rostam J. Neuwirth

**The Cultural Industries
in International Trade Law**

Insights from the NAFTA, the WTO and the EU



Verlag Dr. Kovač

Rostam J. Neuwirth

**The Cultural Industries
in International Trade Law**

Insights from the NAFTA, the WTO and the EU

Verlag Dr. Kovač

**Hamburg
2006**

VERLAG DR. KOVAČ

Leverkusenstr. 13 · 22761 Hamburg · Tel. 040 - 39 88 80-0 · Fax 040 - 39 88 80-55

E-Mail info@verlagdrkovac.de · Internet www.verlagdrkovac.de

Printed with the financial support of:



Das Land
Steiermark

→ Wissenschaft

Bibliografische Information Der Deutschen Bibliothek

Die Deutsche Bibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation
in der Deutschen Nationalbibliographie;
detaillierte bibliografische Daten sind im Internet
über <http://dnb.ddb.de> abrufbar.

ISSN: 1613-0979

ISBN-13: 978-3-8300-2535-1

ISBN-10: 3-8300-2535-1

© VERLAG DR. KOVAČ in Hamburg 2006

Umschlagillustration: Holger Neuwirth (*ohne titel*, 1961)

Printed in Germany

Alle Rechte vorbehalten. Nachdruck, fotomechanische Wiedergabe, Aufnahme in Online-Dienste und Internet sowie Vervielfältigung auf Datenträgern wie CD-ROM etc. nur nach schriftlicher Zustimmung des Verlages.

Gedruckt auf holz-, chlor- und säurefreiem Papier Alster Digital. Alster Digital ist alterungsbeständig und erfüllt die Normen für Archivbeständigkeit ANSI 3948 und ISO 9706.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Foreword</i>	<i>i</i>
<i>Table of Contents</i>	<i>v</i>
<i>Abbreviations</i>	<i>xii</i>
INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER 1: THE CULTURAL INDUSTRIES IN INTERNATIONAL TRADE LAW	1
PART I	9
THE CULTURE INDUSTRY AND THE ‘CULTURE AND TRADE DEBATE’	9
CHAPTER 2: PRELIMINARY METHODOLOGICAL CONSIDERATIONS	9
§ 2.1. Preliminary Remarks on the Trade and Culture Debate	9
2.1.1.1. Background Considerations	9
2.1.1.2. Excursus on the Etymological Origins of the Concepts of Trade and Culture	10
A. The Concept of Trade	10
B. The Concept of Culture	11
2.1.1.3. Clarifications on the Concepts Use in the Present Context	13
§§ 2.1.2. Culture and Trade	15
2.1.2.1. Framing the Culture and Trade Debate	15
2.1.2.2. The Culture and Trade Debate: Parallels to the Present Challenges in Legal Science	19
§§ 2.1.3. The Cultural Industry: A Metaphor for the Culture and Trade Debate?	21
2.1.3.1. The Oxymoron: A <i>Lex Specialis</i> to the <i>Legi Generali</i> of the Trade and Culture Debate	21
2.1.3.2. Transcending the Meaning of the Legal Definition of “Cultural Industries”	22
2.1.3.3. Résumé of the Background of the Analysis	23
§ 2.2. On the Commensurability of the NAFTA, the WTO and the EU	25
§§ 2.2.1. General Introductory Remarks	25
§§ 2.2.2. Specific Differences for Consideration in the Context of the Cultural Industries	27
§§ 2.2.3. The Comparison’s Underlying Path and Objective	28
CHAPTER 3: THE CONCEPT OF THE CULTURAL INDUSTRIES	30
§ 3.1. A Short Survey	30
§ 3.2. The <i>Frankfurter Schule</i> and the Social Theory of ‘Culture Industry’	32
§§ 3.2.1. The Origin of the “Culture Industry” in the Context of the Frankfurt School	32
§§ 3.2.2. Some Elements for a Critique of The Culture Industry: <i>La reproduction interdite?</i>	35
§§ 3.2.3. The Frankfurt School’s Merits in Later Developments	40
§ 3.3. The Reception of the Concept of Cultural Industries in Economics	44
§§ 3.3.1. The Convergence of Politics and Economics	44
§§ 3.3.2. A Political Economy of the Cultural Industries: The Work of Nicholas Garnham	45
§§ 3.3.3. Economics of Culture or Cultural Economics	50
§ 3.4. The Concept’s Itinerary from Philosophy to International Law	56
§§ 3.4.1. From the Frankfurt School to the Canada-United States Free Trade Agreement	56
§§ 3.4.2. The Role of UNESCO in the Dissemination of the Cultural Industries	58
3.4.2.1. An Overview	58
3.4.2.2. UNESCO Documents Related to the Cultural Industries	60
3.4.2.3. UNESCO Documents Explicitly Referring to the Cultural Industries	63
§§ 3.4.3. A Short Summary	66

PART II

69

NAFTA AND THE EVOLUTION OF THE CULTURAL INDUSTRIES' EXEMPTION _ 69

CHAPTER 4: THE SETTING OF AN IMPORTANT LEGAL PRECEDENT..... 69

§ 4.1. NAFTA's Exemption of the Cultural Industries: A Negotiation History..... 69

§§ 4.1.1. The Codification of the "Cultural Industries"..... 69

§§ 4.1.2. A Short Negotiation History..... 71

§§ 4.1.3. The Definition of "Cultural Industry" 75

§§ 4.1.4. The Significance of the Exemption 76

PART III

79

THE CULTURAL INDUSTRIES IN THE LAW OF THE WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION 79

CHAPTER 5: THE EVOLVING TRADING REGIME FROM THE GATT TO THE WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION 79

§ 5.1. General Introductory Remarks..... 79

§§ 5.1.1. An Overview of the *Status Quo*..... 79

§ 5.2. From the Havana Charter to the World Trade Organization..... 83

§§ 5.2.1. The Early Period: From the Havana Charter to the GATT..... 83

§§ 5.2.2. The Evolution of the GATT until the Creation of the World Trade Organization..... 85

§§ 5.2.3. Parallels between the Institutional Setting of the ITO and the WTO..... 88

§§ 5.2.4. The Way Forward: Coherence or Conflict?..... 91

5.2.4.1. The Point of Departure: The Doha Round..... 91

5.2.4.2. The Future: Potentials for Conflicts..... 94

5.2.4.3. Internal and External Coherence..... 96

5.2.4.4. The Absence or Inadequacy of Conflict Rules..... 98

5.2.4.5. Coherence or Conflict: The Implications..... 102

CHAPTER 6: THE GENERAL AGREEMENT ON TARIFFS AND TRADE (GATT)..... 103

§ 6.1. Trade in Goods..... 103

§§ 6.1.1. The Basic Principles of the WTO/GATT System: Comparative Advantage, Reciprocity, MFN Clause and NT Principle..... 103

6.1.1.1. Comparative Advantage..... 103

6.1.1.2. Reciprocity, Most-Favoured-Nation, National Treatment and Flexibility..... 105

§ 6.2. Article IV GATT Relating to Cinematograph Films..... 109

§§ 6.2.1. The Regulatory Scope 109

§§ 6.2.2. The Historical Background and Regulatory Environment of Article IV GATT..... 110

6.2.2.1. Technological Novelty and the Resulting Impact of the New Medium 111

6.2.2.2. National and International Regulatory Responses: The Blum-Byrnes Agreement..... 115

§§ 6.2.3. Cinematograph Films and Television Programming..... 117

6.2.3.1. Television: From Political Cooperation to International Trade Cooperation 117

6.2.3.2. The Controversy over Television in the Sphere of International Trade..... 121

§§ 6.2.4. The Significance of Screen Quotas Today 126

§§ 6.2.5. The Legacy of Article IV GATT..... 129

§ 6.3. Antidumping, Subsidies, and Countervailing Duties – Articles VI and XVI GATT..... 133

§§ 6.3.1. Trade Creating or Inhibiting Practices..... 133

§§ 6.3.2. Dumping and Subsidies in the GATT: An Evolutionary Perspective..... 134

6.3.2.1.	Article VI GATT and Subsequent Developments.....	134
	A. The Agreement on Implementation of Article VI of the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 1994.....	135
	B. The Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures.....	136
	C. Summary.....	137
§§ 6.3.3.	Subsidies, Antidumping and Countervailing Duties in Connection with the Cultural Industries	137
6.3.3.1.	General Remarks.....	137
6.3.3.2.	Dumping and Price Discrimination in the Cultural Industries.....	138
6.3.3.3.	Subsidies and Countervailing Duties in the Realm of the Cultural Industries.....	145
§§ 6.3.4.	Subsidies and Dumping: Some of the Challenges Ahead.....	148
§ 6.4.	The General Exceptions of Articles XX GATT and XVI GATS.....	153
§§ 6.4.1.	General Remarks on the Nature and Interpretation of Exceptions.....	153
6.4.1.1.	The Need for Flexibility: Some Theoretical Considerations.....	153
6.4.1.2.	Exceptions in the GATT/WTO Framework.....	155
	A. Reconciling Trade with Non-Trade Issues.....	155
	B. The Role of Article XX GATT.....	155
	C. The Interpretation of Article XX GATT.....	157
	D. The Interaction of the General Exceptions of GATT, GATS and TRIPS.....	160
§§ 6.4.2.	Equilibrium Lost? The Relevance of the General Exceptions for the Cultural Industries.....	161
§§ 6.4.3.	The Protection of "Public Morals": Para. a) of Articles XX GATT and XIV GATS.....	162
6.4.3.1.	Facts and Definitional Problems.....	162
6.4.3.2.	Interpretative Methods and Conclusive Remarks.....	167
§§ 6.4.4.	Compliance with Laws or Regulations: Para. d) Art. XX GATT/Para. c) Art. XIV GATS.....	168
§§ 6.4.5.	The Protection of National Treasures of Artistic, Historic or Archaeological Value.....	169
6.4.5.1.	Preliminary Remarks on the Relevance of "National Treasures" for the Cultural Industries.....	169
6.4.5.2.	A Short Presentation of the Problem.....	170
6.4.5.3.	Excursus: The Emergence and the Evolution of the Concept of Cultural Property.....	172
	A. The Historical Development.....	172
	B. Definitions of Cultural Property.....	177
	C. "National Treasures" versus "Cultural Property".....	179
§§ 6.4.6.	A final Evaluation of Articles XX GATT and XIV GATS.....	180
6.4.6.1.	Major Difficulties with the Cultural Industries in Relation to the General Exceptions.....	180
6.4.6.2.	A Short Outlook.....	182
§ 6.5.	The Security Exceptions of Articles XXI GATT, XIV^{bis} GATS and 73 TRIPS	184
§§ 6.5.1.	The Security Exception: Certain Parallels to the 'Exception Culturelle'?	184
6.5.1.1.	International Trade versus National Security: "Trade Follows the Flag".....	185
6.5.1.2.	The Cultural Industries as Implements of War: "Trade follows the Film", and "War Follows...?".....	191
§§ 6.5.2.	Security versus Culture: A Critical Evaluation of the Character of Exceptions.....	195
CHAPTER 7: THE GENERAL AGREEMENT ON SERVICES (GATS).....		197
§ 7.1.	The Rise of Services in International Trade.....	197
§§ 7.1.1.	From the GATT 1947 to the GATS 1994.....	197
§§ 7.1.2.	The 'Exception Culturelle' during the Uruguay Round Negotiations.....	200
7.1.2.1.	The History of the 'Exception Culturelle'.....	200
7.1.2.2.	The Scope of the 'Exception Culturelle'.....	202
	A. Cultural Exclusion Clause.....	202
	B. Cultural Exception Clause.....	203
	C. Cultural Specificity Clause.....	203
§§ 7.1.3.	The <i>Status Quo</i> and Consequences of the "Agreement to Disagree".....	204
§ 7.2.	The GATS' Legal Framework.....	206
§§ 7.2.1.	The General Scope and the Guiding Constitutional Principles.....	206
§§ 7.2.2.	Selected GATS Provisions and Some Cultural Considerations.....	208
7.2.2.1.	Free Movement of Persons, Economic Integration and Labour Markets Integration Agreements.....	208
7.2.2.2.	Participation of Developing Countries, Technology, Competition and Subsidies.....	210
7.2.2.3.	The GATS Regime and the Cultural Industries.....	212
§§ 7.2.3.	Cultural Specificity – Gone with the GATS 1994?.....	216

7.2.3.1.	A Short Résumé of the Facts and Findings	216
7.2.3.2.	Some Parameters for the Services Negotiations.....	218
	A. The 1990 Note on Matters Relating to Trade in Audiovisual Services	219
	B. The 1998 Note on Audiovisual Services and WTO Members' Post-Uruguay Round Submissions.....	220
7.2.3.3.	A Final Remark on the Services Negotiations	226
CHAPTER 8: TRADE-RELATED ASPECTS OF INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS (TRIPS)		228
§ 8.1.	The Nature and Rise of Intellectual Property Rights in International Trade ..	228
§§ 8.1.1.	Remarks on the Relevance of Intellectual Property Rights for the Cultural Industries.....	228
§§ 8.1.2.	The Historical Evolution: From Intellectual Cooperation to Intellectual Property Rights under the TRIPS Agreement	233
8.1.2.1.	A Synopsis of Substantive Developments and Institutional Aspects	233
8.1.2.2.	Reasons for the Inclusion of IPRs in the WTO: On the Entwinement of Trade with IPRs	239
§ 8.2.	The Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights.....	244
§§ 8.2.1.	The Legal Framework	244
8.2.1.1.	The Guiding Principles.....	244
	A. The Preamble, Main Principles and Objectives.....	244
	B. National Treatment and Most-Favoured-Nation Treatment	245
	C. Transparency	246
	D. Flexibility	247
8.2.1.2.	The Scope and Basic Provisions of the TRIPS Agreement.....	250
	A. General Remarks.....	250
	B. Copyright and Related Rights Protection under the TRIPS Agreement	251
	C. Some General Problems Related to the TRIPS Agreement.....	253
§§ 8.2.2.	TRIPS Case Law Related to the Cultural Industries.....	254
	A. Cases in the Sphere of the Cultural Industries.....	254
	B. A Short Evaluation of the Cases and Some Interpretative Issues	263
§ 8.3.	The Nexus of Trade, Culture and Intellectual Property Rights: A Summary.	268
§§ 8.3.1.	Résumé of the Achievements of the TRIPS Agreement: Its Merits and Deficiencies	268
§§ 8.3.2.	A Cultural Exception for Intellectual Property Rights?.....	270
CHAPTER 9: THE CANADA PERIODICAL CASE: A CASE STUDY		273
§ 9.1.	NAFTA and the WTO: The Setback of the <i>Canada Periodicals Case</i>	273
§§ 9.1.1.	Introductory Remarks on Regionalism and the NAFTA/WTO Relationship	273
§§ 9.1.2.	The Background of the Case.....	278
§§ 9.1.3.	Facts, Arguments and Findings	280
9.1.3.1.	The Panel Report	280
9.1.3.2.	The Appellate Body Report.....	286
9.1.3.3.	The Aftermath of the Canada – Periodicals Case.....	288
§ 9.2.	A Critical Evaluation of the <i>Canada Periodicals Case</i> and the Cultural Exemption.....	290
§§ 9.2.1.	An Important Legal Precedent for the Global Culture and Trade Debate	290
§§ 9.2.2.	Concluding Remarks	295
CHAPTER 10: THE CULTURAL INDUSTRIES UNDER THE WTO: A RETROSPECTIVE SUMMARY AND THE WAY FORWARD		297
§ 10.1.	A Retrospective Summary on the International Trading Regime	297
§§ 10.1.1.	International Trade Law between Coherence, Constitutionalism and Culture	297
10.1.1.1.	Introduction	297
10.1.1.2.	The Major Changes in the International Trade Regime: Law as a Process	297
10.1.1.3.	The Cultural Industries under the WTO: An Evaluation of the Current State of Affairs.....	298
§ 10.2.	The Legacy of Article IV GATT and the Future of Culture in the WTO.....	303

§§ 10.2.1. Article IV GATT Revisited: A Sleeping Beauty?	303
§§ 10.2.2. Possible Options for the Reconciliation of Culture and Trade within the WTO	304
10.2.2.1. Preliminary Considerations for the Cultural Adjustment of the WTO System	304
10.2.2.2. Exclusion Clauses, Exceptions, Waivers, Understandings or Annexes	305
10.2.2.3. An Enabling or Integration Clause for Culture	307
10.2.2.4. Cooperation, Power Sharing or the Delegation of Competences to Specialised Agencies	309
10.2.2.5. An International Convention on Cultural Diversity	311
A. An International Agreement on Cultural Diversity	313
B. A Critical Evaluation of the Proposal	314
C. Towards the Convention on the Protection of the Diversity of Cultural Contents and Artistic Expressions	317
§ 10.3. The Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions (CDCE)	319
§§ 10.3.1. Preliminary Remarks	319
§§ 10.3.2. The Convention's Content and Scope	321
10.3.2.1. The Title	321
10.3.2.2. The Preamble	322
10.3.2.3. Substantial Remarks	323
10.3.2.4. The Preamble Revisited	325
10.3.2.5. Title I: Objectives and Guiding Principles	326
10.3.2.6. Title II: Scope of Application	328
10.3.2.7. Title III: Definitions	328
10.3.2.8. Title IV: Rights and Obligations of Parties	329
10.3.2.9. Title V: Relationship to Other Instruments	335
A. The Evolution of Article 20 CDCE	336
B. An Evaluation of Article 20 CDCE	337
10.3.2.10. Title VI: Organs of the Convention	338
10.3.2.11. VII: Final Clauses and the Annex	338
§§ 10.3.3. A Critical Evaluation of the Convention in Light of the "Culture and Trade Debate"	340
10.3.3.1. Elements of Governmental Criticism of the Convention	340
A. Respect for Human Rights and Abuse of Governmental Control over Cultural Life	343
B. The Convention's Possible Implications for International Trade Law	345
10.3.3.2. Complementarity between Culture and Trade: What Role of the Convention?	348
10.3.3.3. Résumé	351
§ 10.4. Remarks on Possible Amendments to the WTO Framework	355
PART IV	357
THE CULTURAL INDUSTRIES: THE <i>STRANGE</i> CASE OF THE EUROPEAN UNION	357
CHAPTER 11: THE EUROPEAN UNION IN A GLOBAL CONTEXT	357
§ 11.1. Prologue	357
CHAPTER 12: THE INTERPLAY OF CULTURE AND TRADE IN VARIOUS INTEGRATION STEPS	365
§ 12.1. The History of Institutions in Europe: From the Year 1945 to the Present	365
§§ 12.1.1. General Preliminary Remarks	365
§§ 12.1.2. The Institutional Origins of European Integration after World War II: A Contextual Approach	365
§§ 12.1.3. Institutional Dialogues between Peace, Trade and Culture	371
§§ 12.1.4. European Integration and the Cultural Industries	374
§ 12.2. The EU's Legal Framework With Regard to the Cultural Industries	377
§§ 12.2.1. A Chronology of the Principal Legal Provisions Governing Trade and Culture	377
§§ 12.2.2. The Basic Legal Framework for Economic Integration	377

12.2.2.1. The Rome Treaty: A Static Beginning.....	377
12.2.2.2. Changes and Amendments to the Rome Treaty or a Creeping 'Culturification' of Trade.....	380
CHAPTER 13: INTEGRATION DYNAMICS OF CULTURE AND TRADE	384
§ 13.1. The First Stage: 1958-1974	384
§§ 13.1.1. The Immediate Agenda	384
§§ 13.1.2. Free Movement of Goods	385
13.1.2.1. Customs Union and Common Customs Tariff.....	385
13.1.2.2. Non-Discrimination and the Elimination of Quantitative Restrictions	387
§§ 13.1.3. Free Movement of Persons, Services and Capital	392
13.1.3.1. Free Movement of Workers.....	393
13.1.3.2. Right of Establishment and the Free Movement of Services and Capital.....	394
§§ 13.1.4. Résumé of the First Stage and the Transition towards the Second Stage.....	398
§ 13.2. The Second Stage: 1975-1991	401
§§ 13.2.1. From <i>Mercatus Communis</i> to <i>Sensus Communitatis</i> : Reinforcing the Web of Community Law	401
§§ 13.2.2. From the Common Market to the Internal Market	402
13.2.2.1. Prelude: Juggling Culture and Trade: "Community action in the cultural sector"	402
13.2.2.2. Case Law Touching Upon the Sphere of Culture.....	409
13.2.2.3. The Rise of the Cultural Industries: 'A fresh boost for Culture in the European Community'	411
A. Overview of the Case Law in the Cultural Sector	412
B. The Beginning Process of Positive Integration in the Cultural Sector.....	429
§§ 13.2.3. The Final Years from the Single European Act (SEA) and to the Maastricht Treaty	436
§§ 13.2.4. Résumé of the Second Stage and Leading Over to the Third Stage	439
§ 13.3. The Third Stage: 1992-2005	441
§§ 13.3.1. The Maastricht Treaty and Following Changes to the Treaties with Regard to Culture	441
13.3.1.1. Introduction: A Short Chronology of the Major Events.....	441
13.3.1.2. The Amendments to the European Union's Treaty Structure: A Cultural Perspective.....	445
§§ 13.3.2. An Overview of the Principal Articles Touching Upon the Cultural Industries.....	446
13.3.2.1. The Treaty on European Union	446
13.3.2.2. The Treaty Establishing the European Community	446
A. Article 151 [ex 128] TEC on Culture	446
B. Article 157 [ex 130] TEC on Industry and Article 158 [ex 130a] TEC on Economic and Social Cohesion.....	451
C. Rules Applying to Undertakings (Article 81 TEC) and Aids Granted by States (Art. 87 TEC).....	455
D. The External Dimension of Culture in the European Union.....	458
§§ 13.3.3. The Cultural Industries: An Evaluation of the Changes in the Treaty Framework and Case Law.....	468
13.3.3.1. General Remarks	468
13.3.3.2. The Case Law Experience I: General Cultural Considerations	469
13.3.3.3. The Case Law Experience II: Specific Considerations of the Cultural Industries.....	472
13.3.3.4. Résumé of the Case Law Experience in an Interinstitutional Context	480
§§ 13.3.4. The Treaty Establishing a Constitution for Europe and an Open-ended Résumé.....	483
13.3.4.1. A Short Overview of the Treaty Establishing a Constitution For Europe with Regard to Culture.....	483
13.3.4.2. Résumé of the Third Stage and a Short Outlook	487
CHAPTER 14: CONCLUSIVE REMARKS ON THE EUROPEAN UNION	493
§ 14.1. From a <i>Strange Case</i> to a New Paradigm?	493
14.1.1.1. A Retrospective Summary.....	493
14.1.1.2. The Cultural Industries in a Wider Context: Framing the Debate.....	495
PART V	499
CONCLUSION	499
CHAPTER 15: THE METAPHOR OF CULTURE AND TRADE REVISITED.....	499
§ 15.1. The Cultural Industries or "<i>Contraria sunt complementa</i>"	499

§§ 15.1.1. Principal Remarks.....	499
15.1.1.1. Why Are Cultural Goods and Services Different?.....	500
15.1.1.2. Why Should The Cultural Industries Receive a Different Legal Treatment?.....	503
15.1.1.3. Why Are Cultural Policies and Trade Policies Not Mutually Excluding Each Other?.....	504
15.1.1.4. How Should the Multilateral Trading System Respond to Cultural Concerns?	509
<i>Bibliography</i>	<i>515</i>

Are cultural and trade policies irreconcilable? Are the cultural industries, such as films, books, magazines, television broadcasting, video and music recordings, a special category of goods and services? Hence, do they require special treatment under the multilateral trading system under the aegis of the WTO? What will be the impact of the new UNESCO *Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions* on the international trading system?

These and more related questions are addressed in this book which focuses mainly on the issues pertaining to the so-called “culture and trade debate” and evaluates the present regulation of the cultural industries under international trade law throughout most of the 20th century. Particularly, it inquires into the experiences made within the NAFTA and the EU in order to critically evaluate the current multilateral trading regime established under WTO law with a view of improving its coherence and establishing greater sensitivity for cultural diversity in the world.

ISBN 3-8300-2535-1